Towards Mixed-Initiative Conversational Information Seeking

Hamed Zamani

Center for Intelligent Information Retrieval University of Massachusetts Amherst

zamani@cs.umass.edu



Why Conversational Information Seeking?



Recent advances in automatic speech recognition



Popularity of devices with limited bandwidth interfaces



Recent advances in neural models



Information access is an important service.

What is conversational search?

Is This Conversational Search?

Mitsuku, how did you become a good conversationalist?

Yep, Do you really think I am a good conversationalist? Mousebreaker programmed me to be a good conversationalist.

How are you programmed?



I read what you say and then I compose the best reply I can think of.

How does that actually work though?



Oh. I think it might be a trade secret.



Is This Conversational Search?





Conversations can be complex!



Definitions

Conversation is interactive communication for exchanging information between two or more participants (i.e., humans or machines) that involves a sequence of interactions. While natural language is considered as prerequisite for conversational interactions, conversations can also exhibit other types of interaction with different characteristics and modalities (e.g., click, touch, and gestures).

Zamani, Trippas, Dalton, Radlinski. "Conversational Information Seeking", 2022.

Definitions

Information seeking conversation is a conversation in which the goal of information exchange is satisfying the information needs of one or more participants.

A **Conversational Information Seeking** (CIS) system is a system that satisfies the information needs of one or more users by engaging in **information seeking conversations**. CIS responses are expected to be concise, fluent, stateful, **mixed-initiative**, context-aware, and personalized.

Zamani, Trippas, Dalton, Radlinski. "Conversational Information Seeking", 2022.

Conversational Search has roots in early IR research!

Five general types of information necessary to get the desired state:

- Determination of subject
- Objective and motivation
- Personal characteristics of the inquirer
- Relationship of inquiry description to file organization
- Anticipated or acceptable answers

"Question Negotiation and Information Seeking in Libraries", Robert Taylor, 1968.

Intermediary-based Online IR

Nature of interaction between user and intermediary, in both cognitive and affective senses, is a key factor in search satisfaction.



User-Intermediary Interactions

"Using Discourse Analysis for the Design of Information Retrieval Interaction Mechanisms", Brooks and Belkin, 1983

ī	Alright. <u>Right</u> . The <u>form</u> err, what we got on the form just
U	
ī	says community education in developing countries. That's
U	Yeah
I	approximately yeah/1/ Can you tell me, sort of quite a lot
U	yeah well (illeg.) /2/
I	more about what it is you're going to do-/3a/ it is your disser-
ປ	
I	tation/3b/ Yeah yeah. Tell me what . sorts of
U	Yeah, M.A. dissertation/4/
I	things you're going to do in your dissertation,/5a/ and then the
U	
I	sorts of things you want to <u>rea::d</u> ./5b/
U	That's my sort of, uhm, plan,
т	= Intermediary $ l = l \cos (n/l) = uttorance number$
- 	- intermediaty 0 - 0ser /n/ - utterance number 13 auno 3 Evamplo coon of ucon intermediany pro-coonch interpaction
	gare of Example span of user-intermediary pre-search interaction.

User-Intermediary Interactions

ry	Problem Description functionPD Mode: Ask
	Task:Description of problem topic or clarificationDescription of problem type or contextbDescription of subject areacTerminologydLiteraturee
	User Model functionUM Mode: Ask1
	Task: Personal background (status)a Intentions/goalsb Familiarity with information systemsc Familiarity with topicd
	Knowledge resource codes Subject knowledgeSUE System knowledgeSYS Ouery language1
	Index language2 Data base
	Knowldge of usersUS Types Characteristics
nation	Figure 4. Coding key for function and resource analysis.

CODE

VARIARI F

"Using Discourse Analysis for the Design of Information Figure & Retrieval Interaction Mechanisms", Brooks and Belkin, 1983

The THOMAS System

THOMAS, THE REFERENCE RETRIEVAL PROGRAM

Help can be obtained whenever the program has displayed the start symbol by typing '?' immediately after it.

Please give a short name for the search: Alv.Resp.

Start searching: pulmonary alveoli

Influence of fasting on blood gas tension, pH, and related values in dogs.; Pickrell *et al*, *Am J Vet Res*, *34*, 805–8, Jun 73 I. J A Pickrell, 2. J L Mauderly, 3. B A Muggenburg, 4. U C Luft, 5. animal experiments, 6. animal feed, 7. arteries, 8. blood, 9. body temperature, 10. carbon dioxide, 11. dogs, 12. fasting, 13. hemoglobin, 14. hydrogen-ion concentration, 15. irrigation, 16. lung, 17. oxygen, 18. pulmonary alveoli, 19. respiration, 20. time factors

"Information Retrieval through Man-Machine Dialogue", Oddy, 1977.

The THOMAS System



"Information Retrieval through Man-Machine Dialogue", Oddy, 1977.

The I³R System



"I³R: A New Approach to the Design of Document Retrieval Systems", Croft and Thompson, 1986.

			The filler of the second s	i
	it. Biological de la companya		System Messages	_ Content
		Evaluate t	the following documents for relevance	Quit Session Suspend Session
			Search Number 1 Results	•
		Show:	1. The Structure of the "THE"-Multipro System	ogramming
Window		Show 🔤	2.Communicating Sequential Processes	
Iop Scroll-Up Scroll-Down		Show Rel	3.A System for Interprocess Communica Resource Sharing Computer Network	ation in a Content Relevan
Bottom Suspend Help		Show Rel	4.A Case Study in Programming for Parallel-Processors	Not-Rei Done Help
		Show Rel	5.Further Comments on Dijkstra's Com Programming Control Problem	current
			Search Number 2 Results	
		Show Rel	5.A System for Interprocess Communica Resource Sharing Computer Network	tion in a
Window Top		Show Fel	6.Thoth, a Portable Real-Time Operati	ng System
Scroll-Up Scroll-Down Bottom		Show Rel	7.A Case Study in Programming for Parallel-Processors	ran tel
Suspend Help		Show Rel	8.The Control of Response Times in Mu Systems by Memory Allocations	lti-Class
		Show Rel	9.Further Comments on Dijkstra's Conc Programming Control Problem	urrent

"I³R: A New Approach to the Design of Document Retrieval Systems", Croft and Thompson, 1986.







FIG. 2. Major system components.

"I³R: A New Approach to the Design of Document Retrieval Systems", Croft and Thompson, 1986.

More Recently

•

- TREC CAsT: TREC Conversational Assistance Track
- CoQA: Conversational Question Answering
- QuAC: Question Answering in Context
- ShARC: Shaping Answers with Rules through Conversation
- ConvQuestions: Conversational Question Answering over Knowledge Graphs

```
Section: Augusto Pinochet : Intellectual life ...
STUDENT: Was he known for being intelligent?
TEACHER: \hookrightarrow No, Pinochet was publicly known
     as a man with a lack of culture.
STUDENT: why did people feel that way?
TEACHER: \hookrightarrow reinforced by the fact that he also
     portrayed himself as a common man
STUDENT: did he have any hobbies?
TEACHER: \hookrightarrow Yes, Before wresting power from
     Allende, Pinochet had written two books.
STUDENT: what is the name of a book written by
     him?
TEACHER: \hookrightarrow Geopolitica (1968) and Campana
     de Tarapaca (1972).
STUDENT: what were the books about?
TEACHER: \hookrightarrow Chile's military literature.
STUDENT: was there anything noteworthy re-
     garding his books?
TEACHER: \hookrightarrow Yes, In Geopolitica Pinochet pla-
     giarized (...) Gregorio Rodriguez Tascon
STUDENT: did he deny those allegations?
TEACHER: \checkmark No answer
STUDENT: what did he plagiarize in Geopolitica?
TEACHER: \rightarrow In Geopolitica Pinochet plagia-
     rized (...) paragraphs from a 1949 presentation
     ...
```

Mixed-Initiative Interactions in Human Conversation

Mixed-initiative levels	Capabilities
Unsolicited reporting	Agent may notify others of critical information as it arises
Subdialogue initiation	Agent may initiate subdialogues to clarify, correct, and so on
Fixed subtask initiative Negotiated mixed initiative	Agent takes initiative to solve predefined subtasks Agents coordinate and negotiate with other agents to determine initiative

Αстіон	Amount (%)
Evaluating and comparing options	25
Suggesting courses of action	23
Clarifying and establishing state	13.5
Clarifying or confirming the communication	13.5
Discussing problem-solving strategy	10
Summarizing courses of action	8
Identifying problems and alternatives	7

"Mixed-Initiative Interaction", Allen, Guinn, and Horvitz, 1999.

Clarification

- Confirming or clarifying the communication
 - For example, to reduce ASR error.
- Correcting user mistakes
 - Did you mean ...?
- Intent clarification

Search Clarification

Maps

What version of Windows are windows 10 windows 8 wind

Videos

Images

How to Fix a Blue Screen of D https://www.lifewire.com/how-to-fix-a-blue

1. The most important Blue Screen of Death t 2. Check that there's enough free space left o 3. Scan your computer for viruses. Some viru: 4. Apply all available Windows service packs : See all full list on lifewire.com

Videos of blue screen bing.com/videos





NSFL also known as NLS means Not Safe some website has sent you meaning no or

1800FLOWERS® Anniv https://www.1800flowers.com (Ad) When It Matters Most, Trust 1

RomanceHer...

Zazzle

15% Off code

Anniversary Best Se

Our Most Popular Bouquets & A Perfect Gift For Someone Sc nsfl.com - Nassau Suffolk F https://www.nsfl.com -

President - Mickey Kane Vice President - D Kane Head Referee - Tom O'Hanlon Town Rep Info · NSFL Documents · New Co

NSFL Football

nsfl.jcink.net/index.php -Welcome back: your last visit was on Toda





Ad	2	0
Hu	<u> </u>	-

Ball Gown

Strapless...

\$179.99

LightInTheBox

51% price drop

dillards wedding bridesmaid dres cheap wedding wedding dresse jcpenney weddi jishouse weddir online wedding unique inexpen

Related se

David's Bridal[™] Official - Shop Our Collections https://www.davidsbridal.com -

(Ad) Let Us Help You Find Your Dream Dress At Your Dream Price. Shop Our New Styles!

Wedding Dresses Now \$99 · Up to \$300 Off Bridal · Make an Appointment · Free Shipping Over \$125

Clarifying Question?

• Query: acts 17:16

To generate a clarifying question, we need to identify different aspects of the query.

Query Reformulation Data

- shoes \rightarrow running shoes
- shoes → shoes basketball
- shoes \rightarrow formal shoes
- shoes \rightarrow shoes nike
- shoes \rightarrow shoes adidas
- shoes \rightarrow shoes for women
- shoes \rightarrow shoes for kids
- shoes \rightarrow shoes sale

• ...

- shoes \rightarrow shoes online
- shoes \rightarrow shoes near me

Taxonomy of Search Clarification

- Disambiguation
- Preference
 - Personal information ("for whom")
 - Spatial information ("where")
 - Temporal information ("when")
 - Purpose ("for what purpose")
- Topic
 - Sub-topic information
 - Event and news
- Comparison

Zamani, Dumais, Craswell, Bennett, Lueck. "Generating Clarifying Questions for Information Retrieval". In WWW '20. 29

Question Templates

- What do you want to know about **QUERY**?
- What do you want to know about this **QUERY_ENTITY_TYPE**?
- What **ASPECT_ENTITY_TYPE** are you looking for?
- Whom are you looking for?

• ...

Question Generation



Query Clarification Maximization Model



Zamani, Dumais, Craswell, Bennett, Lueck. "Generating Clarifying Questions for Information Retrieval". In WWW '20.

Query Aspect Generation

- To generate a good clarification question, we must first identify different aspects of the query.
- We mine Bing query logs to find all possible reformulations with the form of $X \rightarrow XY$ or $X \rightarrow YX$.
 - "shoes" → "running shoes"
 - "running shoes" \rightarrow "running shoes for women"
- Input: X
- Output: all possible *Y*s with some pre-processing (e.g., initial stopword removal, etc.)





- I_q is the set of all intents for the query q.
- I_q is generally *unknown*, but can be estimated using query reformulation data.

Zamani, Dumais, Craswell, Bennett, Lueck. "Generating Clarifying Questions for Information Retrieval". In WWW '20.



- The good news is the objective is a **monotone**, **sub-modular** function
- There is a nice approximation guarantee for a greedy algorithm that generates answers one by one.
- Theorem (Fisher, Nemhauser, Wolsey, 1978): if *f* is monotone, sub-modular, and *f*(Ø) = 0 then the greedy algorithm return a solution that achieves:

$$f(S) > \left(1 - \frac{1}{e}\right)OPT$$

Zamani, Dumais, Craswell, Bennett, Lueck. "Generating Clarifying Questions for Information Retrieval". In WWW '20.

Training

• Training is based on REINFORCE:

$$L = -(r(q^*) - r(q^*_{ML})) \sum_{t=1}^{T} \log p(q_t | q_1 \dots q_{t-1})$$

- *q*^{*} is obtained by sampling from the output distribution of the model.
- q_{ML}^* is the output of pre-trained model.
- $r(\cdot)$ is the reward function, based on clarification utility.

Query	rytary
Question	what do you want to know about this medication?
Options	dosage, coupon, side effects, cost, information
Query	acts 17:16
Question	what bible translation are you looking for?
Options	american standard version, kjv, esv, niv, nlt
Query	that's how i got to memphis
Question	what song information are you looking for?
Options	lyrics, stream, download, artist
Query Question Options	alan turing what do you want to know about this british math- ematician? movie, suicide note, quotes, biography

Zamani, Dumais, Craswell, Bennett, Lueck. "Generating Clarifying Questions for Information Retrieval". In WWW '20.
User Interactions with Search Clarification

Quotes from User Interviews

- "convenient and easy"
- "it saves time and steps"
- "it sometimes cues the user to things they may not have considered"
- "helped them find more relevant results"

Opinion on non-relevant and low-quality clarifications:

- "It's like when I look at iPhones, and eBay says 'since you looked at iPhones you may be interested in these hair curlers!' And I'm like, well that's weird, whatever"
- The quality of result page after using clarification is important.

Zamani, Dumais, Craswell, Bennett, Lueck. "Generating Clarifying Questions for Information Retrieval". In WWW '20.

Key Findings from User Interviews

- Functional benefit:
 - "questions help guide users in the right direction"
- Emotional benefit:
 - it brings to users a sense of confidence that the search engine understands what the user wants.
 - it gives the users a **sense of security** and coming to the right conclusion.
 - The users pointed out that sometimes, especially when it comes to product search, they feel **less stress** when the search engine asks questions on different features of the product.

Zamani, Dumais, Craswell, Bennett, Lueck. "Generating Clarifying Questions for Information Retrieval". In WWW '20.





+48% more user engagement

Zamani, Dumais, Craswell, Bennett, Lueck. "Generating Clarifying Questions for Information Retrieval". In WWW '20.



Query type	Relative engagement rate		
Natural language question	1.58		
Other queries	0.96		
Faceted queries	1.52		
Ambiguous queries	0.70		
Tail queries	1.01		
Torso queries	1.02		
Head queries	0.99		

Zamani, Mitra, Chen, Lueck, Mitra, Bennett, Craswell, Dumais. "Analyzing and Learning from User Interactions for Search Clarification". In SIGIR '20.

Clarification is also useful for exploratory search!

Over 7% of interactions with the clarification pane lead to *exploration*!

Free-Form Clarification Responses



dinosaur

Information Need (Facet) I'm looking for the Discovery Channel's dinosaur site, which has pictures of dinosaurs and games.



Are you looking for dinosaur books?



No, just the discovery channel website.



Are you looking for meat-eating or plant-eating dinosaurs?



l'm not sure.

🔇 No answer



Would you like to see pictures or videos of dinosaurs?



I'd like to see pictures of dinosaurs on the discovery channels website.



dinosaur

Information Need (Facet) I'm looking for a list of all (or many of) the different kinds of dinosaurs, with pictures.



Are you looking for dinosaur books?



Yes, if they contain pictures of all the different kinds of dinosaurs.



Which dinosaurs are you interested in?



l'm interested in any and all dinosaurs.



Do you want a list of dinosaurs names?



Yes, I would also like the list to include pictures of the dinosaurs.







DULAC

# topics # faceted topics # ambiguous topics	198 141 57
 # facets Average facet per topic Median facet per topic # informational facets # navigational facets 	762 3.85 ± 1.05 4 577 185
# questions# question-answer pairsAverage terms per questionAverage terms per answer	2,639 10,277 9.49 ± 2.53 8.21 ± 4.42

Aliannejadi, Zamani, Crestani, Croft. "Asking Clarifying Questions in Open-Domain Information Seeking Conversations". In SIGIR '19.



Zamani, Lueck, Chen, Quispe, Luu, Craswell. "MIMICS: A Large-Scale Data Collection for Search Clarification". In CIKM '20.

Data Statistics

	MIMICS-Click	MIMICS-ClickExplore	MIMICS-Manual
# unique queries	414,362	64,007	2464
# query-clarification pairs	414,362	168,921	2832
# clarifications per query	1 ± 0	2.64 ± 1.11	1.15 ± 0.36
min & max clarifications per query	1 & 1	2 & 89	1 & 3
# candidate answers	2.81 ± 1.06	3.47 ± 1.20	3.06 ± 1.05
min & max # candidate answers	2 & 5	2 & 5	2 & 5
# query-clarification pairs with positive engagement	71,188	89,441	N/A
# query-clarification pairs with low/medium/high impressions	264,908 / 105,879 / 43,575	52,071 / 60,907 / 55,943	N/A

Zamani, Lueck, Chen, Quispe, Luu, Craswell. "MIMICS: A Large-Scale Data Collection for Search Clarification". In CIKM '20.

Qulac vs. MIMICS

	Qulac [SIGIR 2019]	MIMICS [CIKM 2020]
# queries	198	>450,000
Document type	webpages	webpages
Clarifying questions	Generated through crowdsourcing	Generated using a machine learning model
User responses to clarification	Generated through crowdsourcing	Real user interaction signals

MIMICS-Duo [Tavakoli et al., SIGIR 2022] enables both offline and online evaluation for search clarification.

Bridging the Gap between IR and RecSys

Joint Modeling of Search and Recommendation



Zamani and Croft. "Joint Modeling and Optimization of Search and Recommendation". In DESIRES '18.⁵⁸



estimated unigram distribution⁵⁹

The Lord of the Rings (1978)	Batman Returns (1992)	Gandhi (1982)	The Mask (1994)
fantasy	batman	documentary	cartoon
magic	character	film	parody
movies	superhero	directed	movie
wizard	horror	prize	black ⁵
animation	thriller	award	comic
potter	starring	supporting	comedy
cartoon	fantasy	films	film
fiction	movie	movie	monster
classic	joker	fiction	thriller
novel	comedy	drama	shows

Zamani and Croft. "Learning a Joint Search and Recommendation Model from User-Item Interactions". In WSDM '20.

Applications of JSR

- Improving both search and recommendation performance
- Interpretable, transparent, and explainable recommendation
- User profiling
- Universal representation across domain and modality
- Conversational recommendation

Modeling and Measuring Conversational Search

With a focus on mixed-initiative interactions





Feedback first



Feedback after



Examples of Feedback

Query clarification

Do you have any theme in mind?

-					
	summer	modern	fall	beach	retro
	Summer	modern	Tun	beach	read

Query suggestion

Related searches for wedding dressesformal wedding dresses for guestsgoogle wedding dressesdillards wedding dressesdresses for wedding occasionwedding dresses for older bridescheap wedding dressesdavids bridal ocaladesigner wedding gowns

Cost and Benefit (Gain) of a Conversation

$$G(t_1, t_2, \cdots, t_T) = \sum_{i=1}^T g(t_i)$$

We can assume that the user only accumulates gain on an assessment of a relevant document.

$$C(t_1, t_2, \cdots, t_T) = \sum_{i=1}^T c(t_i)$$

We can consider time as a good estimator of each interaction cost.

 $R = \frac{G(t_1, t_2, \cdots, t_T)}{C(t_1, t_2, \cdots, t_T)}$

Estimating the Cost

- Crowdsourcing using the complex TREC Web Track topics.
- Once the user submits a query, the system responds with a result snippet or document for up to five documents (one by one). Then the user can either
 - Reformulate the query, or
 - Answer clarifying questions, or
 - Select a query suggestion, or
 - "Not interested"
- 81 crowdworkers, 144 queries, 1280 snippets, and 268 feedback responses

Estimating the Cost

- The average time taken
 - to issue a query: 29.3 s
 - to assess a result snippet: 6.3 s
 - to assess a result web page: 17 s
 - to provide feedback: 8.3 s
 - ...
- They can be used to estimate the cost of each interaction.
- We can then conduct some simulated analysis to explore gain ratio for each conversational strategy.

The strategies

FA-QC combination is inferior.

FF-QS leads to a small increase over the baseline but is not superior.

No dominant strategy, depends on #assessments.



Best strategies

Searcher is only willing to **examine a few items**: FA-QS Searcher is willing to **go deeper**: FF-QC



Agent-Initiative Interactions

Three Major Dimensions in Agent-Initiative Interactions

- Initiation Moment (*when* to initiate a conversation?)
 - Instant initiation
 - Opportune moment initiation
- Initiation purpose (*why* to initiate a conversation?)
 - Filtering streaming information based on user profile
 - Recommendation
 - Following up a past conversation
 - Contributing to a multi-party human conversation
 - Feedback request
- Initiation means (*how* to initiate a conversation?)
 - Device
 - Interaction Modality

Wudhwa and Zamani. "Towards System-Initiative Conversational Information Seeking". *DESIRES '21*. 75



Wudhwa and Zamani. "Towards System-Initiative Conversational Information Seeking". *DESIRES '21*.

Initiation Purposes: Contributing to a multiparty human conversation

- Example:
 - Monitoring factual accuracy of human conversations.
 - Introducing opposing views on the topic being discussed.

Initiation Purposes: Following up a Past User-System Conversation

- Based on new information or new deployment of models
- Example:
 - CIS systems are not by any means perfect and they make mistakes in responding to user's requests. Based on new information or new models deployed in the system, a CIS system may initiate a conversation at an opportune moment to accept and correct its mistakes that was made in the past.

Open Problems and Future Directions

- Evaluating mixed-initiative conversational search systems
- Studying other types of mixed-initiative interactions
- Search result list explanation
- Integrating chit-chat into conversational search and recommendation
- Generating clarifying questions with no access to query logs
- Preference elicitation
- Joint conversational search and recommendation
"Conversational Information Seeking"

by *Zamani*, Trippas, Dalton, Radlinski. To appear in FntIR 2023.

"Generating Clarifying Questions for Information Retrieval" by *Zamani*, Dumais, Craswell, Bennett, Lueck. In WWW '20.

"Analyzing and Learning from User Interactions with Search Clarification" by <u>Zamani</u>, Mitra, Chen, Lueck, Diaz, Bennett, Craswell, Dumais. In SIGIR '20.

"MIMICS: A Large-Scale Data Collection for Search Clarification" by *Zamani*, Lueck, Chen, Quispe, Luu, Craswell. In CIKM '20.

"Learning a Joint Search and Recommendation Model from User-Item Interactions" by <u>Zamani</u> and Croft. In WSDM '20.

"Asking Clarifying Questions in Open-Domain Information Seeking Conversation" by Aliannejadi, <u>Zamani</u>, Crestani, Croft. In SIGIR '19.

"Analyzing Mixed Initiatives and Search Strategies during Conversational Search" by Aliannejadi, Azzopardi, <u>Zamani</u>, Kanoulas, Thomas, Craswell. In CIKM '21.

"Joint Modeling and Optimization of Search and Recommendation" by <u>Zamani</u> and Croft. In **DESIRES '18**.

"Towards System-Initiative Conversational Information Seeking" by Wadhwa and <u>Zamani</u>. In **DESIRES '21**.

"MIMICS-Duo: Enabling Both Offline & Online Evaluations for Search Clarification" by Tavakoli, Trippas, <u>Zamani</u>, Scholer, Sanderson. In SIGIR '22.

References

Thank you!



Foundations and Trends in Information Retrieval

Conversational Information Seeking

Hamed Zamani, Johanne Trippas, Jeff Dalton, and Filip Radlinski



https://arxiv.org/pdf/2201.08808.pdf





Macaw

https://github.com/microsoft/macaw

Zamani and Craswell. "Macaw: An Extensible Conversational Information Seeking Platform". In SIGIR '20.







Action 1 & 2: Search and QA



Other Actions

- Action 4: Clarification
- Action 5: Recommendation
- Action 6: ...



setting N \bigcirc Wizard of